

**U.S. District Court  
California Northern District (San Francisco)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 3:19-cv-03512-WHO**

Nightingale et al v. U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services et al  
Assigned to: Judge William H. Orrick  
Demand: \$0  
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 06/19/2019  
Jury Demand: None  
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of Information Act  
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**Zachary Nightingale**

represented by **Claudia Valenzuela**  
American Immigration Council  
1331 G Street NW  
Suite 200  
Washington, DC 20005  
202-507-7540  
Email: [cvalenzuela@immcouncil.org](mailto:cvalenzuela@immcouncil.org)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Jamieson Creighton**  
American Immigration Council  
1331 G Street NW  
Suite 200  
Washington, DC 20005  
United Sta  
(202)507-7514  
Email: [ecreighton@immcouncil.org](mailto:ecreighton@immcouncil.org)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Leila Kang**  
Northwest Immigrant Rights Project  
615 2nd Ave. Ste. 400  
Seattle, WA 98104  
206-957-8608  
Email: [leila@nwirp.org](mailto:leila@nwirp.org)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Mary A Kenney**  
American Immigration Council  
1331 G St. NW  
Suite 200  
Washington, DC 20005  
202-507-7512  
Fax: 202-742-5619  
Email: [mkenney@immcouncil.org](mailto:mkenney@immcouncil.org)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Matthew Hyrum Adams**  
Northwest Immigrant Rights Project  
615 Second Ave., Ste. 400  
Seattle, WA 98104  
206-957-8611  
Fax: 206-587-4025  
Email: [matt@nwirp.org](mailto:matt@nwirp.org)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stacy Eva Tolchin**  
Law Offices of Stacy Tolchin  
634 S. Spring St.  
Suite 500A  
Los Angeles, CA 94104  
213-622-7450  
Fax: 213-622-7233  
Email: [stacy@tolchinimmigration.com](mailto:stacy@tolchinimmigration.com)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Trina Ann Realmuto**  
American Immigration Council  
1318 Beacon Street  
Suite 18  
Brookline, MA 02446  
United Sta  
857-305-3600  
Email: [trealmuto@immcouncil.org](mailto:trealmuto@immcouncil.org)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Plaintiff**

**Courtney McDermed**

represented by **Claudia Valenzuela**  
(See above for address)  
**PRO HAC VICE**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Emily Jamieson Creighton**  
(See above for address)  
**PRO HAC VICE**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Leila Kang**  
(See above for address)  
**PRO HAC VICE**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Mary A Kenney**  
(See above for address)  
**PRO HAC VICE**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Matthew Hyrum Adams**  
(See above for address)  
**PRO HAC VICE**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Stacy Eva Tolchin**  
(See above for address)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Trina Ann Realmuto**  
(See above for address)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Plaintiff**

**Cheryl David**

represented by **Claudia Valenzuela**  
(See above for address)  
**PRO HAC VICE**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Emily Jamieson Creighton**  
(See above for address)  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Leila Kang**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Mary A Kenney**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Matthew Hyrum Adams**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stacy Eva Tolchin**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Trina Ann Realmuto**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Pao Lopa**

represented by **Claudia Valenzuela**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Jamieson Creighton**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Leila Kang**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Mary A Kenney**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Matthew Hyrum Adams**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stacy Eva Tolchin**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Trina Ann Realmuto**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Plaintiff**

**Maribel Carandang**

represented by **Claudia Valenzuela**  
(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Emily Jamieson Creighton**

(See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Leila Kang**  
 (See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Mary A Kenney**  
 (See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Matthew Hyrum Adams**  
 (See above for address)  
*PRO HAC VICE*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Stacy Eva Tolchin**  
 (See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Trina Ann Realmuto**  
 (See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**Defendant**

**U.S. Citizenship and Immigration  
 Services**

represented by **Cristen Cori Handley**  
 U.S. Department of Justice Civil Division  
 Federal Programs  
 1100 L Street NW  
 Washington, DC 20005  
 202-305-2677  
 Email: [cristen.handley@usdoj.gov](mailto:cristen.handley@usdoj.gov)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**U.S. Immigration and Customs  
 Enforcement**

represented by **Cristen Cori Handley**  
 (See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Defendant**

**U.S. Department of Homeland Security**

represented by **Cristen Cori Handley**  
 (See above for address)  
*LEAD ATTORNEY*  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
06/19/2019	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against All Defendants ( Filing fee \$ 400, receipt number 0971-13449903.). Filed by Zachary Nightingale, Pao Lopa, Cheryl David, Courtney McDermed, Maribel Carandang. (Realmuto, Trina) (Filed on 6/19/2019) (Entered: 06/19/2019)
06/19/2019	<u>2</u>	Civil Cover Sheet by Maribel Carandang, Cheryl David, Pao Lopa, Courtney McDermed, Zachary Nightingale . (Realmuto, Trina) (Filed on 6/19/2019) (Entered: 06/19/2019)

06/19/2019	<u>3</u>	Proposed Summons. (Realmuto, Trina) (Filed on 6/19/2019) (Entered: 06/19/2019)
06/19/2019	<u>4</u>	Proposed Summons. (Realmuto, Trina) (Filed on 6/19/2019) (Entered: 06/19/2019)
06/19/2019	<u>5</u>	Proposed Summons. (Realmuto, Trina) (Filed on 6/19/2019) (Entered: 06/19/2019)
06/19/2019	<u>6</u>	Proposed Summons. (Realmuto, Trina) (Filed on 6/19/2019) (Entered: 06/19/2019)
06/19/2019	<u>7</u>	Proposed Summons. (Realmuto, Trina) (Filed on 6/19/2019) (Entered: 06/19/2019)
06/19/2019	<u>8</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Stacy Eva Tolchin <i>as co-counsel</i> (Tolchin, Stacy) (Filed on 6/19/2019) (Entered: 06/19/2019)
06/19/2019	9	<p>Case assigned to Magistrate Judge Laurel Beeler.</p> <p>Counsel for plaintiff or the removing party is responsible for serving the Complaint or Notice of Removal, Summons and the assigned judge's standing orders and all other new case documents upon the opposing parties. For information, visit <i>E-Filing A New Civil Case</i> at <a href="http://cand.uscourts.gov/ecf/caseopening">http://cand.uscourts.gov/ecf/caseopening</a>.</p> <p>Standing orders can be downloaded from the court's web page at <a href="http://www.cand.uscourts.gov/judges">www.cand.uscourts.gov/judges</a>. Upon receipt, the summons will be issued and returned electronically. Counsel is required to send chambers a copy of the initiating documents pursuant to L.R. 5-1(e)(7). A scheduling order will be sent by Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) within two business days. Consent/Declination due by 7/3/2019. (ajsS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 6/19/2019) (Entered: 06/19/2019)</p>
06/20/2019	<u>10</u>	<b>Initial Case Management Scheduling Order with ADR Deadlines: Case Management Statement due by 9/12/2019. Initial Case Management Conference set for 9/19/2019 11:00 AM in San Francisco, Courtroom B, 15th Floor. (fabS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 6/20/2019) (Entered: 06/20/2019)</b>
06/20/2019	<u>11</u>	Summons Issued as to U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement, U.S. Attorney and U.S. Attorney General (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Summons, # <u>2</u> Summons, # <u>3</u> Summons, # <u>4</u> Summons)(fabS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 6/20/2019) (Entered: 06/20/2019)
06/28/2019	12	CLERK'S NOTICE RESETTING CASE MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE: Initial Case Management Conference previously set for 9/19/2019 is reset to <b>10/10/2019 at 11:00 AM</b> in San Francisco, Courtroom B, 15th Floor. Case Management Statement due by 10/3/2019. ( <i>This is a text-only entry generated by the court. There is no document associated with this entry.</i> ) (ejkS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 6/28/2019) (Entered: 06/28/2019)
07/01/2019	<u>13</u>	CONSENT/DECLINATION to Proceed Before a US Magistrate Judge by Maribel Carandang, Cheryl David, Pao Lopa, Courtney McDermed, Zachary Nightingale.. (Realmuto, Trina) (Filed on 7/1/2019) (Entered: 07/01/2019)
07/01/2019	14	<p>CLERK'S NOTICE OF IMPENDING REASSIGNMENT TO A U.S. DISTRICT COURT JUDGE: The Clerk of this Court will now randomly reassign this case to a District Judge because either (1) a party has not consented to the jurisdiction of a Magistrate Judge, or (2) time is of the essence in deciding a pending judicial action for which the necessary consents to Magistrate Judge jurisdiction have not been secured. You will be informed by separate notice of the district judge to whom this case is reassigned.</p> <p>ALL HEARING DATES PRESENTLY SCHEDULED BEFORE THE CURRENT MAGISTRATE JUDGE ARE VACATED AND SHOULD BE RE-NOTICED FOR HEARING BEFORE THE JUDGE TO WHOM THIS CASE IS REASSIGNED.</p> <p><i>This is a text only docket entry; there is no document associated with this notice.</i> (ejkS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/1/2019) (Entered: 07/01/2019)</p>
07/02/2019	<u>15</u>	CLERK'S NOTICE Re: Motion to Relate Cases (lrcS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/2/2019) (Entered: 07/02/2019)
07/02/2019	<u>16</u>	<b>ORDER REASSIGNING CASE. Case reassigned using a proportionate, random, and blind system pursuant to General Order No. 44 to Judge William H. Orrick</b>

		<b>for all further proceedings. Magistrate Judge Laurel Beeler no longer assigned to case, Notice: The assigned judge participates in the Cameras in the Courtroom Pilot Project. See General Order No. 65 and <a href="http://cand.uscourts.gov/cameras..">http://cand.uscourts.gov/cameras..</a> Signed by Clerk on 7/2/19. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Notice of Eligibility for Video Recording)(as, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/2/2019) (Entered: 07/02/2019)</b>
07/03/2019	<u>17</u>	AFFIDAVIT of Service for Summons, Complaint, and case initiating documents served on Defendants, Attorney General William Barr, and US Attorney's Office for the Northern District of California on June 25, 2019, filed by Maribel Carandang, Cheryl David, Pao Lopa, Courtney McDermid, Zachary Nightingale. (Realmuto, Trina) (Filed on 7/3/2019) (Entered: 07/03/2019)
07/08/2019	<u>18</u>	<b>CASE MANAGEMENT CONFERENCE ORDER – Case Management Conference set for 9/10/2019 02:00 PM in San Francisco, Courtroom 02, 17th Floor. Case Management Statement due by 9/3/2019. Signed by Judge William H. Orrick on 07/08/2019. (jmdS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/8/2019) (Entered: 07/08/2019)</b>
07/08/2019	<u>19</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by Maribel Carandang, Cheryl David, Pao Lopa, Courtney McDermid, Zachary Nightingale of <i>Case Management Conference Order and Judge Orrick's Standing Order for Civil Cases</i> (Realmuto, Trina) (Filed on 7/8/2019) (Entered: 07/08/2019)
07/23/2019	<u>20</u>	MOTION for leave to appear in Pro Hac Vice ( Filing fee \$ 310, receipt number 0971-13543976.) filed by Maribel Carandang, Cheryl David, Pao Lopa, Courtney McDermid, Zachary Nightingale. (Kang, Leila) (Filed on 7/23/2019) (Entered: 07/23/2019)
07/23/2019	<u>21</u>	MOTION for leave to appear in Pro Hac Vice ( Filing fee \$ 310, receipt number 0971-13545417.) filed by Maribel Carandang, Cheryl David, Pao Lopa, Courtney McDermid, Zachary Nightingale. (Adams, Matthew) (Filed on 7/23/2019) (Entered: 07/23/2019)
07/29/2019	<u>22</u>	<b>Order by Judge William H. Orrick granting <u>20</u> Motion for Pro Hac Vice by Leila Kang. (jmdS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/29/2019) (Entered: 07/29/2019)</b>
07/29/2019	<u>23</u>	<b>Order by Judge William H. Orrick granting <u>21</u> Motion for Pro Hac Vice by Matt Adams. (jmdS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 7/29/2019) (Entered: 07/29/2019)</b>
07/30/2019	<u>24</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Cristen Cori Handley (Handley, Cristen) (Filed on 7/30/2019) (Entered: 07/30/2019)
07/31/2019	<u>25</u>	ANSWER to Complaint by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Handley, Cristen) (Filed on 7/31/2019) Modified on 8/1/2019 (amgS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 07/31/2019)
08/02/2019	<u>26</u>	MOTION & [PROPOSED] ORDER for leave to appear in Pro Hac Vice ( Filing fee \$ 310, receipt number 0971-13575738.) filed by Maribel Carandang, Cheryl David, Pao Lopa, Courtney McDermid, Zachary Nightingale. (Kenney, Mary) (Filed on 8/2/2019) Modified on 8/6/2019 (aaa, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 08/02/2019)
08/05/2019	<u>27</u>	MOTION & [PROPOSED] ORDER for leave to appear in Pro Hac Vice ( Filing fee \$ 310, receipt number 0971-13581757.) filed by Maribel Carandang, Cheryl David, Pao Lopa, Courtney McDermid, Zachary Nightingale. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Good Standing)(Creighton, Emily) (Filed on 8/5/2019) Modified on 8/6/2019 (aaa, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 08/05/2019)
08/08/2019	<u>28</u>	MOTION to Certify Class filed by Maribel Carandang, Cheryl David, Pao Lopa, Courtney McDermid, Zachary Nightingale. Motion Hearing set for 10/2/2019 02:00 PM in San Francisco, Courtroom 02, 17th Floor before Judge William H. Orrick. Responses due by 8/22/2019. Replies due by 8/29/2019. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Index of Exhibits, # <u>2</u> Declaration First Realmuto Dec., # <u>3</u> Declaration Nightingale Dec. and attachment, # <u>4</u> Declaration David Dec., # <u>5</u> Declaration McDermid Dec., # <u>6</u> Declaration Abrutyn Dec., # <u>7</u> Declaration Cleveland Dec., # <u>8</u> Declaration Hall Dec., # <u>9</u> Declaration Asch Dec., # <u>10</u> Declaration Taurel Dec. and attachment, # <u>11</u> Declaration Ellison Dec., # <u>12</u> Declaration Hansen Dec., # <u>13</u> Declaration Lee Dec., # <u>14</u> Declaration Falgout Dec., # <u>15</u> Declaration Dobrin Dec. and attachments, # <u>16</u>



		Declaration Phelps Dec., # <u>17</u> Declaration Second Realmuto Dec., # <u>18</u> Declaration Kenney Dec., # <u>19</u> Declaration Adams Dec., # <u>20</u> Declaration Tolchin Dec., # <u>21</u> Exhibit Lopa FOIA Status Check, # <u>22</u> Exhibit Carandang FOIA Status Check, # <u>23</u> Proposed Order)(Realmuto, Trina) (Filed on 8/8/2019) (Entered: 08/08/2019)
08/15/2019	<u>29</u>	MOTION & [PROPOSED] ORDER for leave to appear in Pro Hac Vice ( Filing fee \$ 310, receipt number 0971-13613235.) filed by Maribel Carandang, Cheryl David, Pao Lopa, Courtney McDermid, Zachary Nightingale. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Good Standing)(Valenzuela, Claudia) (Filed on 8/15/2019) Modified on 8/16/2019 (aaaS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 08/15/2019)
08/15/2019	<u>30</u>	MOTION to Continue <i>Defendants' Deadline to Respond to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification</i> filed by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration, # <u>2</u> Proposed Order)(Handley, Cristen) (Filed on 8/15/2019) (Entered: 08/15/2019)
08/19/2019	<u>31</u>	OPPOSITION/RESPONSE (re <u>30</u> MOTION to Continue <i>Defendants' Deadline to Respond to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification</i> ) filed by Maribel Carandang, Cheryl David, Pao Lopa, Courtney McDermid, Zachary Nightingale. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration Third Realmuto Dec.)(Realmuto, Trina) (Filed on 8/19/2019) (Entered: 08/19/2019)
08/22/2019	<u>32</u>	<b>ORDER GRANTING <u>30</u> MOTION TO CONTINUE DEFENDANTS' DEADLINE TO RESPOND TO PLAINTIFFS' <u>28</u> MOTION FOR CLASS CERTIFICATION – Response due by 9/5/2019. Signed by Judge William H. Orrick on 08/22/2019. (jmdS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 8/22/2019) (Entered: 08/22/2019)</b>
08/29/2019	<u>33</u>	ADR Certification (ADR L.R. 3-5 b) of discussion of ADR options (Realmuto, Trina) (Filed on 8/29/2019) (Entered: 08/29/2019)
08/29/2019	<u>34</u>	ADR Certification (ADR L.R. 3-5 b) of discussion of ADR options (Handley, Cristen) (Filed on 8/29/2019) (Entered: 08/29/2019)
09/03/2019	<u>35</u>	JOINT CASE MANAGEMENT STATEMENT & [PROPOSED] ORDER ; filed by Maribel Carandang, Cheryl David, Pao Lopa, Courtney McDermid, Zachary Nightingale. (Realmuto, Trina) (Filed on 9/3/2019) Modified on 9/4/2019 (aaaS, COURT STAFF). (Entered: 09/03/2019)
09/05/2019	<u>36</u>	OPPOSITION/RESPONSE (re <u>28</u> MOTION to Certify Class ) filed by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Jill A. Eggleston, # <u>2</u> Declaration of Toni Fuentes)(Handley, Cristen) (Filed on 9/5/2019) (Entered: 09/05/2019)
09/06/2019	<u>37</u>	CLERK'S NOTICE – Case Management Conference continued to 10/2/2019 02:00 PM in San Francisco, Courtroom 02, 17th Floor (to coincide with motion hearing). <i>(This is a text-only entry generated by the court. There is no document associated with this entry.)</i> (jmdS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/6/2019) (Entered: 09/06/2019)
09/09/2019	<u>38</u>	<b>Order by Judge William H. Orrick granting <u>27</u> Motion for Pro Hac Vice by Emily J. Creighton. (jmdS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/9/2019) (Entered: 09/09/2019)</b>
09/09/2019	<u>39</u>	<b>Order by Judge William H. Orrick granting <u>29</u> Motion for Pro Hac Vice by Claudia Valenzuela. (jmdS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/9/2019) (Entered: 09/09/2019)</b>
09/09/2019	<u>40</u>	<b>Order by Judge William H. Orrick granting <u>26</u> Motion for Pro Hac Vice by Mary Kenney. (jmdS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/9/2019) (Entered: 09/09/2019)</b>
09/11/2019	<u>41</u>	CLERK'S NOTICE ADVANCING HEARING – Hearing as to <u>28</u> MOTION to Certify Class and Initial Case Management Conference reset for 10/1/2019 03:00 PM in San Francisco, Courtroom 02, 17th Floor. <i>(This is a text-only entry generated by the court. There is no document associated with this entry.)</i> (jmdS, COURT STAFF) (Filed on 9/11/2019) (Entered: 09/11/2019)

09/12/2019	<u>42</u>	REPLY (re <u>28</u> MOTION to Certify Class ) filed by Maribel Carandang, Cheryl David, Pao Lopa, Courtney McDermid, Zachary Nightingale. (Realmuto, Trina) (Filed on 9/12/2019) (Entered: 09/12/2019)
10/01/2019	<u>43</u>	<b>Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge William H. Orrick: Motion Hearing held on 10/1/2019 re <u>28</u> MOTION to Certify Class. Motion taken under submission; written order to follow. Further Case Management Conference set for 1/21/2020 02:00 PM in San Francisco, Courtroom 02, 17th Floor. Case Management Statement due by 1/14/2020. Total Time in Court: 36 minutes. Court Reporter: Ruth Levine Ekhaus. (jmdS, COURT STAFF) (Date Filed: 10/1/2019) (Entered: 10/03/2019)</b>